Consultation training in the UK: initial and in-service perspectives of Educational and Child Psychologists [ECPs]

Presentation at the International School Psychology Association Conference
Amsterdam July 2016

Dr. Sandra Dunsmuir Director, Educational Psychology Group, University College London
Dr. Emma-Kate Kennedy Deputy Director for Educational Psychology, Tavistock & Portman NHS Foundation Trust
Dr. Jeremy Monsen Principal Educational Psychologist, West London Tri-Borough
PART 1:

Consultation training in the UK: An exploratory qualitative analysis of current pre-service teaching and learning for trainee Educational and Child Psychologists [ECPs]

Dr. Sandra Dunsmuir & Dr. Emma-Kate Kennedy
Objectives

• Provide background and context to initial training in consultation

• Present methodology of present study and key points emerging from thematic analysis

• Identify limitations of research and provide suggestions for future developments in this area
Background and context

Need for an **evidence-based approach to training** in consultation

How do initial training providers integrate:

*the best available research on teaching consultation*

*their professional expertise about what, when and how to teach and assess consultation*

*while accounting for the preferences and characteristics of learners?*

Current professional, legal and socio-political variables affecting training more generally in a UK context
At end of programme, trainee educational psychologists will demonstrate:

4.1 knowledge and understanding of models of psychological consultation that are evidence-informed

4.2 effective interpersonal and communication skills that enable them to consult with children, families and other professionals (e.g. effective listening, a non-judgemental stance, empathy, acting as advocate)

4.3 competence in using consultation to respond to needs and concerns at individual, group, class and whole organisation levels

4.4 skill in offering a clear explanation of the model and process of consultation being used

4.5 use of a transparent, systematic problem-solving approach within the consultation process

4.6 ability to monitor and evaluate the effectiveness of their own consultations and interventions

4.7 skill in empowering consultees and in working collaboratively, identifying the strengths and skills of others that can be utilised

4.8 use of evidence-informed person centred approaches to ensure that children, young people and other consultees are appropriately included within the process and are able to contribute to plans and decisions that are made for them.
Methodology

Telephone interviews were conducted to explore:

i) theoretical models, course content and teaching practices

ii) structure of consultation training

iii) supervision of consultation

iv) assessment approaches used

v) evaluation in terms of student, consultee and client outcomes

Interviews audio-recorded/transcribed [use of Atlas.ti, qualitative data analysis software]

Thematic analysis (Braun & Clarke, 2006)
Participants

Participants nominated by heads of programs, who were contacted by e-mail

Post-graduate qualifications in educational psychology
Part-time professional practice
Part-time academic and professional tutor

Gender distribution: 12 female, 4 male

Age distribution:
- 3 tutors aged between 30-39 years of age
- 4 tutors aged 40-49 years
- 7 tutors aged 50-59 years
- 2 tutors aged 60+
Themes identified

1. Definitions of consultation
2. Methods (activity theory, solution focused approaches, RADIO, motivational interviewing, appreciative enquiry, Schein-Humble enquiry, video (e.g. VERP))
3. Frameworks (problem solving models, COMOIRA, staged systematic approach, process consultation, Wagner's model, mixed frameworks)
5. Assessment of student (formative, summative, multiple sources)
6. Development of consultation skills (processes, curriculum content, range of practice)
7. Evaluation (service delivery, consultee outcomes, client outcomes)
8. Commissions (time allocation models, traded services, statutory work)
9. Marketing/raising awareness of consultation
Other emerging lines of enquiry

1. Lack of shared agreement on ‘consultation’

2. ‘Golden thread’ between theory, frameworks and methods/techniques, and how these are applied in ‘the age of evidence’

3. Developmental progression in consultation competence

4. Coherence between the university and professional practice placement, including the place of supervision

5. Approaches and issues in assessment
Delivering consultation

“...I think they would probably like a bit more multi-agency consultation....”

multi-agency consultation

“...writing up consultation, some service have a format for writing up consultation and that kind of varies across practice...”

recording

“...and again it’s based largely on implementation science...and other organisational psychology where the consultation processes are, they are just huge...what is the most effective way to capture an organisation’s beliefs and practices....”

consultation at the level of the organisation

“...we would encourage them to model that if they were working with a group of teachers in a school in that we will maybe chair the first few sessions and as time goes by we will take a lesser role....”

consultation to groups

Teachers, parents, children and young people

Assessment of children and young people
The ‘how’ it is taught [Methods, Frameworks & Processes]

Activity theory

solution focused approaches

Video Enhanced Reflective Practice

Appreciative enquiry

Schein-Humble Enquiry

Motivational interviewing

problem solving models

COMOIRA

Process consultation

staged systemic approach

Wagner’s model

mixed frameworks

peer supervision

interpersonal skills simulation

tutor providing shaping feedback

role play

peer review

didactic teaching

peer mentoring

Reflecting Teams

RADIO
“...so to some extent I guess it would depend on to what extent the service delivery model defines consultation as a discrete activity...[the trainees] all have a theoretical sense of what they think consultation is but it is defined in different ways...”

“I sometimes think that in the time I trained I wasn’t really taught consultation, so I think conceptually I know what it is in my head but I think sometimes I would find it more tricky to explain it to another person...”

“And what we emphasise as well is the difference between the broad church of the definition you have given and I suppose the very specific, very clear, triadic model which is working with a child usually but once removed...”

“...we’ve been having a very explicit debate for the past five years among our team in terms of what our shared understanding of consultation is and how we teach it...”

definitions
# Developmental progression (Year 1)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Academic (4 day blocks)</th>
<th>Autumn</th>
<th>Spring</th>
<th>Summer</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| PBL 1: Educational Psychology: Practice and Context  | PBL 5: Secondary Social Emotional and Behavioural Difficulties (SEBD) | PBL 9: Neuropsychology and Autistic Spectrum Disorders  
PBL 2: Raising Achievement: Whole School and Community Focus | PBL 10: Individual Interventions Workshops & seminars  
PBL 3: Literacy Difficulties and Bilingualism in the Primary School  
PBL 4: Reducing Social Exclusion | PBL 6: Promoting Inclusion: SEN and Disability Focus  
PBL 7: Children in Early Years Settings: Language and Behaviour issues  
PBL 8: Profound and Multiple Learning Difficulties (PMLD): Challenging Behaviour - School and Family | Workshops & Seminars  
Professional Development tutorials  
Formal Progress Review meetings  
CAMHS and Social Services meetings  
Shadowing Educational Psychologists  
Multi-Professional Working interviews  
Secondary School Placement | Early Years Placement  
Visits to Special Provision |
| Workshops & seminars  
Professional Development tutorials  
Formal Progress Review meetings  
Formal Progress Review meetings  
CAMHS and Social Services meetings  
Shadowing Educational Psychologists  
Multi-Professional Working interviews  
Secondary School Placement | Workshops & Seminars  
Professional Development tutorials  
Formal Progress Review meetings  
CAMHS and Social Services meetings  
Shadowing Educational Psychologists  
Multi-Professional Working interviews  
Secondary School Placement | Early Years Placement  
Visits to Special Provision |
| Placement (44 days – 1 day a week) | LA Observations and visits  
Primary School Placement  
English as an Additional Language (EAL) assignment | Research Methods Workshops  
Conducting systematic literature review workshops  
Conducting a meta analysis workshop | Research Methods Workshops  
Conducting systematic literature review workshops  
Conducting a meta analysis workshop | Thesis consultation sessions  
Research thesis tutorials |

| Research | | | |
## Developmental progression (Year 2)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Academic (10 x 3 day UCL blocks)</th>
<th>Autumn</th>
<th>Spring</th>
<th>Summer</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>PBL 11: Dyslexia and ADHD</strong></td>
<td>PBL 13: Tribunal, Parent Partnership and LA Provision</td>
<td>PBL 16: Educational Psychology: Professional &amp; Personal Review</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>PBL 12: Family/Community Interventions</strong></td>
<td>PBL 14: Children &amp; Young People in Public Care</td>
<td>Workshops &amp; seminars</td>
<td>Workshops &amp; seminars</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Workshops &amp; seminars</td>
<td>PBL 15: Multi-agency Organisational Development Project: Promoting Psychological Well-being</td>
<td>Professional Development tutorials</td>
<td>PD tutorials</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Professional Development tutorials</td>
<td>CBT Supervision Peer supervision</td>
<td>CBT Supervision Peer supervision</td>
<td>Peer supervision</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Placement tasks</td>
<td>Placement tasks</td>
<td>Placement tasks</td>
<td>Placement tasks</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Formal Progress Review meeting</td>
<td>Formal Progress Review meetings at UCL Supervisors’ Training Day</td>
<td>Formal Progress Review meetings at UCL Supervisors’ Training Day</td>
<td>Submit Y2 Portfolio</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(at Placement Service)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Supervisors’ Training Day</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Placement (130 days – 3 days a week)</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Research</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Research thesis tutorials and panel presentations</td>
<td>Research thesis tutorials and panel presentations</td>
<td>Research thesis tutorials and panel presentations</td>
<td>Advanced research methods workshop</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Meta-analysis surgery session</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Thesis consultation sessions</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## Developmental progression (Year 3)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Academic (6 x 3 day UCL blocks)</th>
<th>Autumn</th>
<th>Spring</th>
<th>Summer</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>PBL trigger sessions</td>
<td>PBL case presentations</td>
<td>PBL case presentations</td>
<td>Workshops/ Master classes/ Innovative practice sessions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PBL case presentations</td>
<td>Workshops/ Master classes/ Innovative practice sessions</td>
<td>Workshops/ Masterclasses/ Innovative practice sessions</td>
<td>Professional Development tutorials</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Workshops/ Master classes/ Innovative practice sessions</td>
<td>Professional Development tutorials</td>
<td>Peer supervision</td>
<td>VIG supervision</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Professional Development tutorials</td>
<td>Peer supervision</td>
<td>VIG supervision</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peer supervision</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Placement (130 days – 3 days a week)</th>
<th>Autumn</th>
<th>Spring</th>
<th>Summer</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Placement tasks</td>
<td>Placement tasks</td>
<td>Placement tasks</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Formal Progress Review meetings by teleconference</td>
<td>Formal Progress Review meetings by teleconference</td>
<td>Formal Progress Reviews at UCL</td>
<td>Supervisors’ Training Day</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Research</th>
<th>Autumn</th>
<th>Spring</th>
<th>Summer</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Research thesis tutorials (focus on empirical paper)</td>
<td>Thesis tutorials</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Group research thesis tutorials (focus on Dissemination and Impact)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
“...I suppose once you are in the service environment the supervisor is the next key person because you can still be in an environment where there isn’t a lot of consultation going on or you can have a supervisor that’s committed to it and so they can model and the trainee can shadow some good consultation...”

“...because we’ve got supervision training and especially in recent years I think a lot of supervisors have been through the doctoral programme themselves so have more knowledge and understanding and sympathy with a more reflective approach where you go into depth about the process of what’s happening when the trainees go into schools...”

“...there are local authorities out there who are literally wading through Education and Health Care Plans and assessment and meetings and consultation only comes in in the broadest sense, which might be when you are sitting in a room with a bunch of people and trying to go through a staged model of problem solving and trying to get some outcomes. It really is a mixed bag out there, so a central problem is the variation of opportunity to practice and that filters through...”

“...there is a weakness there, because it depends on how the supervisor is supervising consultation, and quite a lot of the trainees will have had possibly more training on it than the supervisors...”

professional practice placements/supervision
“...we also do an interpersonal skills and consultation simulation... they each have different competencies which we hope to see addressed and then in between each station the person would give them some formative feedback...”

“...what we do encourage them to do is to make use of peer assessment where as dyads they use this...”

“...as we do with every skill on the course really, it’s a self-evaluative checklist to start with, which the trainee completes and then discusses with their supervisor on placement and then brings it in to the tutor. And that’s formative in that it happens several times over Year 1, Year 2 and Year 3...”

“...in terms of demonstrating knowledge we have two assessed products, one is writing up an initial consultation which the trainee observes from a theoretical perspective...”

“...it would be basically, on placement, the feedback that we receive from the supervisors as to the progress they are making, the skills they are acquiring and whether or not they have been deemed to have passed the requirements for that placement...”

“...theoretically, epistemologically it relates to what I said [before]...it’s not about weighing and measuring people. We expect people to be able to demonstrate levels of proficiency, we expect qualitatively to see people thinking and their practice develops and we do. And we appreciate that and we work with them to appreciate how they do change. But we don’t have any systematic way of measuring their progression...”

assessing consultation competence
Promoting conceptual clarity between psychological theory, frameworks, models and approaches/techniques

Investigations of processes for teaching and effectiveness in the development of consultation competence and capability

The role of professional associations in promoting frameworks to support best practice
Contact details

Dr. Sandra Dunsmuir
s.dunsmuir@ucl.ac.uk

Dr. Emma Kennedy
E kennedy2@tavi-port.nhs.uk
PART 2:

Consultation training in the UK: in-service training themes and issues

Questionnaire Survey Initial Outcomes

Dr. Jeremy Monsen
Objectives

Provide a background and context to a recent England wide Questionnaire Survey of practicing EPs views on aspects of ‘consultative working practices’ (2016)

Present an overview of the methodology used and key points emerging from an initial thematic analysis of responses.

Identify limitations of the current study and provide suggestions for future developments in this area
Background and Context

1990s: consultation standard model of EP service delivery

2008+: increasingly ‘traded models’ of EP deployment

Concern: robustness/applicability of ‘consultation’ in a business-type environment

In addition:

- no agreed definition or understanding of what consultation is
- confusion for EPs, clients and stakeholders
Methodology

Ethics approval part of wider study (Part 1 & 2)

Semi-structured on-line questionnaire survey developed and piloted

21 main questions (open, closed, scaling options, demographic details)

Informed by reviews of the literature

On-line responses coded, initial content analysis and thematic analysis
Participants

54 in total

Represented 43 distinct Educational Psychology services across England

8 (15%) male; 46 (85%) female; 3 (5%) did not specify

45 (85%) reported that their initial training course covered consultation, 8 (15%) reported that it did not

53 (98%) reported using a consultative model to inform their practice
Headline Themes identified

A lack of a clearly defined and agreed definition of what ‘consultation’ actually means

Confusion between levels of analysis:

- Theory
- Techniques/Strategies (e.g., Solution Focused Therapy)
- Models (e.g., Interviewing skills, Attachment Theory)
- Overarching Executive Frameworks (e.g., Problem Analysis)

“...I don't think I'm thinking theories and frameworks much in consultation although I can see that there is a place for that with some EPs...”

“...the definition does not do justice to the complexity of the task of consultation...”
A tendency to go for a default ‘eclectic’ position

Confusion over what a traded or business model is and how consultation can be creatively used

Variable experience of practice supervision to support a critical appraisal of actions

“...I wish we did not have to do this. By being bought in by the school, they feel they are buying a product and the school, by definition, becomes the client. This messes with our independence...”

“...Supervision has changed over the years and now, seems to be less about psychological supervision and more a chance to catch up on admin etc...[I] hope that the younger EPs are not missing out on too much...”
Suggested Future Directions

Complete full analysis of questionnaire survey data

Setting up a National Working Party of EPs to explore:

- definitions of consultation
- enhancing clarity around psychological theory, frameworks, models and approaches/techniques
- promoting the role of critical supervision and Continuing Professional Practice
- define and clarify what a ‘traded’ context is and the role of consultation within this
Contact details

Dr. Jeremy J. Monsen

jeremy.Monsen@rbkc.gov.uk
jeremymonsen@hotmail.co.uk